

1. Will you have volunteers painting? That would be great!
2. Boring design, uninspired
3. I like the waves and the colorfulness. It makes ya want to keep looking
4. Sadly the new proposed artwork is just a re-hash of the old artwork and as such is still inferior art – not worthy of the beautifully renovated building. We would like to have really great artwork – not some “compromise” solution. The image – lifted from the old mural – proposed for the front looks ridiculous – like a giant mustache from a children’s book illustration. Please don’t give this a pass-through just to “get it done” and over with. It is too important. Question: How will the comments be collected and reported by to the community? Library & Art Commissions. –Rosanne Liggett rosanneadana@hotmail.com
5. I like it! Nice use of various elements from the existing murals. Looks great!
6. What about a mural on the handicapped ramp? It is so welcoming.
7. Like the tree—where is the guitar?
8. Like the idea of the tree, but “leaves” part is a little too dark.
9. Is there no mural on the playground wall because of the sun? It was always wonderful to look at while playing.
10. The artwork on Cortland is fine, as proposed, --universal and elegantly rendered. It’s about the world inside a book. It makes sense for a library, it probably won’t be controversial to the community 30 yrs. from now. You could argue about its necessity, or benefit to the building’s appearance. The Mourie mural is more problematic. This big tree has an overt symbolism that is cartoonish. The little acknowledgements to the “mural that was” feel gratuitous, or obligatory perhaps. I don’t think this one will wear well over time. The tile work that “dissolves” as it rises looks unfinished – like you ran out of money. Draw a strong line beneath the windows and tile up to it as a base material on the building or better yet do nothing on this façade.
11. The murals look bad today and need to be addressed. The decision to be made should be:
 - a. Redo the murals, in an attempt to preserve a period of history in the life of the building & community. The existing murals do not reflect the lives of the multi-cultural inhabitants of Bernal Heights today. But

then, neither did the original, slightly neo-classical architecture of the library. It's a point in time that is represented in both cases.

- b. Return the building to its original, simple but solid state without murals. Let the library be an "open work" defined by the people inside and their purpose for visiting the library.

We don't need to decorate this building in a new way. ---with new symbols to reflect the community today, or worse, to simply add "interest" to the facades. The proposals as presented here feel like a compromise for the sake of art, not necessary to the benefit of the bldg. (it doesn't need it) or the legacy of the existing murals.

12. Yes 1st choice – plain building with no murals – like all other CCSF library buildings. Yes Cortland Ave façade acceptable as drawn. No Moultrie Street façade too stylized, less ethnic – does not reflect totality of Bernal Heights residents.
13. The library is a fine example of simple, understated, WPA architecture. It is honest, in its lack of adornment. The murals were done at a very different time. -- From then, 1940s, and from now, 2010s. --And I'm sure they were a welcome addition to a struggling environment of Cortland in the 1980s. I wish the building could be returned to its original, quiet but dignified appearance without the murals or other art work. Hang a large beautifully printed photograph in the interior of the artists @ work on the mural. Sent the money – not on decorations for a building –but on books for us to read.—*Bernal Heights Resident*
14. Do not change the Cortland Street Mural. It is my childhood.
15. The front wave/ribbon design is fine. The tree of life for the side of the building combines good elements of old mural with the tree as support. It is also fine.
16. Very Good, both—Moultrie and Cortland facades. Is it possible to include something about Mauricio Vela in the design(s); had it not been for Mauricio, we would have no art whatsoever.
17. How about the little wall behind the garbage cans on the playground?
18. Thanks for all your work. I'm disturbed by the fact that there are no women & children represented. Perhaps it would be better if the mural just depicted nature rather than people? .—*Bernal Resident*
19. Will the wall facing the playground be painted a solid color while waiting for Phase 2? I am hoping so, as it looks bad. Love the designs!

20. Deena Zacharin /34 Bennington Street /San Francisco, CA 94110 (415)826-3565 /
zacharin@comcast.net / June 25, 2011

Dear Bernal Library Art Committee:

First of all, thank you for all the hard work and time the committee has put into resolving this issue. It is so important to our community that there are people like yourselves who are willing to commit the time and energy to work on an issue so important to our neighborhood's aesthetics.

I'm sorry I missed the two recent meetings about the murals because I had started a new job and couldn't make it. However, I thought there would be options posted to the blog and had waited to give my input on those. I guess I was unclear on the process, and I'm sorry if I'm late with my feedback now that the proposals have already gone to the Library Commission.

There are certain elements of the proposed murals that i like, and some I'm not so happy with. I like that it will be mosaic, so it will stay vibrant. But this is also a little scary because it seems so permanent. I think it would be good to put the mosaic on a removable board so that if future generations want to remove it it can be saved and put somewhere else. I like the tree, because it reminded me of what i liked about Reuben Rude's style. I wish I saw more of the style in his portfolio in the proposed mural.

I understand the Moultrie side of the building was supposed to include elements taken from the old mural. I am thrilled that there is finally recognition of the Ohlone people who lived on this land. However, I am disappointed with some of the other elements depicted. Some of the elements that were chosen were the same images that bothered me in the first mural. The pyramid says nothing to me about Bernal or it's heritage. Jose Bernal received a land grant from the Mexican government -- not the Maya people. I've also never understood the Japanese style wave as it relates to Bernal, or the planets.

Some of the newer images don't resonate with me, although I understand that possibly they are images from the original murals that I've never noticed because of the fading. In my opinion, the boxes which i assume represent earthquake shacks, are not as representative of early settlers as some of the early Victorian houses and stores depicted in the Bernal History Project book. The proposal seems to depict new images of people that weren't in the old mural. I find it disconcerting that there are no images of women, children, seniors or families. There is no gay imagery even though Bernal has been known for it's lesbian culture and gay and lesbian families for decades. What about the artists, musicians and writers who have flocked here for generations? Or the old intellectuals and leftists that Red Hill was named after. What about the old-time Italian shopkeepers? When I looked at the old mural again I realized that the singing person is a

woman, and that is most evident from her bust. However, the new depiction has a black area above her lip that looks like a mustache and her bust is not included. I thought it was another male when I saw the proposal.

I am particularly disappointed because the Reuben Rude artwork linked to the blog was more exciting and unique in style. When I heard he was one of the artists, I was happy because I liked his portfolio that was posted. The blog implies there were proposals submitted that sketched out what the artist would do on the library. I'm sorry if I missed giving input on that -- I didn't know there was a proposal that looks like the current one - - nothing was posted at the time, and as I mentioned, I couldn't make it to the in-person meetings. I was also thrilled that Collette Crutcher was one of the chosen artists, but was disappointed when I heard she couldn't do it.

As for the Cortland side, I like the idea of the relief book, but unfortunately can't really say I like the rest. It seems dated to me, but not in a good way.

We've come this far as a community thanks to all your hard work – as well as the perseverance of several activists which led to the committee being formed. I certainly hope we don't feel like we have to rush these proposals through just to hold to some arbitrary deadline. This is too critical an issue for our community to finalize this too quickly.

Sincerely, *Deena Zacharin*

21. Love Love Love It Thank U The tree with the people on top!

22. They are awesome!

23. To Whom It May Concern;

Regarding the proposed mural for the Bernal Heights library: First off, WHERE ARE THE WOMEN? There are absolutely NO women on this mural, unless you count the person that could either look like a woman or a man (but mostly looks like a man because of some shading on the upper lip that looks like a mustache); Or the little person with the hat next to the Native American that could also go either way.

Also, where is the representation of gay families? There is not even a hinting of gay pride symbols or anything, which is strange since a significant amount of families and non-families are LGBT. Not only are there no LGBT families, there are no straight families either. There are no type of families at all on this mural which is crazy since so many families live in Bernal Heights.

Third all of you have realized that there are only two cultures represented in this mural? Only two? Seriously? If there is a day when you can look me in the eyes and tell me there are only two cultures that make up Bernal Heights, then we'll talk. But can you do this now? No I didn't think so. This is getting to be on the verge of ridiculousness. Did the muralist even take into consideration where this was going to be? The neighborhood? The people? Because it really

doesn't look that way to me. This is coming from a resident of Bernal Heights who has lived here all her whole life and knows a thing or two about her neighborhood.

I'm sorry if this sounds aggravated but I think I have a right to see all of my community represented in the mural on my library.

24. Not representative of the community TODAY. No women, no children, no reference to the gay community. Let's focus on the current constituency – the people who live here and pay taxes here.
25. Neither mural represents the community of Bernal Heights, but are instead a great way to further divide the residents. One represents GLBT and the other Afro American and Hispanic Communities. Where are the: Asians, white people, children, woman? Shame on you?
26. The exterior of the library building should be completely cleaned, repaired, and restored to good condition BEFORE any new (dubious) artwork is applied. What is the plan for this?

PS: why aren't all the different ethnic groups in our Bernal represented in the artwork for Moultrie St. Don't think only the mainly Hispanic icons are "diverse."
27. I love the design for the front – it a beautiful interpretation of what is already there. The tree graphic is less interesting, but does a nice job of retaining some of the old imagery. I have to ask are all of the people in the tree illo [sic] men? Seems like we should add some female representation.
28. The more I looked the façade the more I liked it - the colors are similar to the current mural. I wish it was less fleur de lys – looking, especially the ribbon at the beginning & end of "Bernal Heights Branch." They highlight the name, but don't really have a purpose. Small waves or clouds would make more sense. The Moultrie St. side – I love the symbols & the gold / brown. The tree doesn't quite work – too much like "The lord's supper" on a pedestal (in shape only). I like the idea of the symbols growing out of a tree, however. Maybe a tree with multiple trunks. I'm not that crazy about the tiles either. I think the colors are ok but the square tiles are jarring, at least for me. Kudos for coming this far! *Kathy Angus*
29. Why do we have to have a mural? I think it's because Luis the Librarian can score political points with David Campos. The community was manipulated by Campos.
30. It's not necessary to put artwork on three sides – It is wasteful of \$. That money could be spent on the community or other library services. And – the artwork proposed looks terrible together. The library deserves high quality artwork to match the beautiful interior.
31. How appropriate! Lavatory tile above our local urinal.
32. I strongly approve of the new murals. My 1st choice would be a straightforward off white paint job, but if we must look at murals, the proposed are ok. BML [?] Elsie St.

33. Beautiful Artwork!! The murals capture the community. I LOVE IT all. *Eileen*
34. (I'm a 3- yr. Bernal resident) Tile?! Please don't make an unsightly situation worse by further marring the front face of a beautiful WPA building. The architecture is beautiful and timeless – a tile mural is not timeless! Why not allow the beauty of the building shine through? Create a rotating or small artspace if there has to be some sort of art presence. Please be rational and think long term! This is a place of learning – not a venue for an art war. Please use our money more wisely than this.

Sue A. Blackman

From: Valerie Reichert
Sent: Tuesday, July 12, 2011 10:14 AM
To: Sue A. Blackman; Linda Brooks-Burton; Melissa Gooch; Luis Herrera
Subject: Three more comments from BHE comment boxes
Attachments: letter 35 pt 1.pdf; letter 35 pt. 2.pdf

The attached comment letter #35 was too long to type up quickly so here is a scan of it. (I e-mailed sender and requested a digital version.) Below are two short comments that were also in the box. –Valerie

Comment #36 : to [sic] similar to so many other murals. Something more original would be good.

Comment # 37 Bravo – a very politically difficult challenge handled very skillfully. –*Michael Gillette.*

Valerie Reichert
Bernal Heights Children's Librarian
500 Cortland Street
San Francisco, 94110
415.355-5663

vreichert@sfpl.org
SAN FRANCISCO PUBLIC LIBRARY

Official SFPL Use Only

When the Friends of the San Francisco Library were fundraising for the renovation, here's how they described the building on their website:

The Bernal Heights Branch is a beautiful WPA building that was built in 1940. The renovation, which began in 2008, will include seismic retrofitting as well as ADA accessibility, while preserving the wonderful historic character of the existing building.

Catch that last part? *Preserving the wonderful historic character of the existing building.* That's what people who donated to the renovation were promised. That's what we paid for. Is tile in keeping with that? It really, really, really, deeply, truly isn't.

Obviously, I have no idea how this decision got made or whether it is a done deal. I'm concerned that the only single voice able to influence this slow artistic car crash of a situation is the lone man who objected to the removal of the old mural in the first place. Yet it remains not just hard, but impossible, to square this proposal (and I hope it's still just a proposal) with the history of this beautiful, quiet monument of a building. Did you know that the WPA project employed a tremendous number of women? Or that 45 percent of African Americans families were either on relief or employed by the WPA? The WPA was hailed as a breakthrough in labor equity at the time – in other words, a shining example of diversity in action. It's the people who worked on the building in the first place who deserve to be celebrated. It's their voices that should get heard. And they would, if the building – the result of their hard work – was allowed to speak for itself, to stand proudly on its own without the candy-colored tile.

J.J.
Bocana Street
jenjohns@gmail.com

OK, it seems to me that some of the premises underlying the proposed tile mural are a little “off.” And here’s what I mean by that.

Asking the wrong question. I know that one guy in particular didn’t want to see the old mural go. But it seems like all of the conversation that followed started with the premise that *something* had to go on the library’s exterior to replace it. But I don’t think “what should go there now?” is the foundational question. I think it’s “should anything – particularly anything so permanent – go there now?” The answer to that, for me at least, a happy neighborhood citizen who loves Bernal not just for its diversity and its people but for its unique architecture (the earthquake shacks, the WPA library), is a resounding “NO!”

Targeting the wrong building. I’m probably not the first person to note how ironic it is that sitting directly across from our historic library is a community center – the most likely and sensible place for a mural (actually, TWO murals, which is twice the problem) designed to celebrate community diversity. Just look at this clinically for a second. On one side of the street is a community center that could use a facelift and has zero architectural uniqueness or significance. On other side of the street, you have a WPA building, a beautiful library that simply needs a good exterior paint job to restore it to its original beauty. Many WPA buildings are on the National Register of Historic Places – did you know that? Plus, a public library embodies diversity by its very nature. Think of all the books inside of the Bernal library, all of the stories and worldviews and perspectives that are represented by its collections. No mural in the world could come even close to reflecting the richness and diversity that already exists inside that building – or to representing even a fraction of the diversity – in age, ethnicity, race, gender, profession, and life story – of the people who walk into that library every day. So a mural is not just redundant – it’s a shadow of the richness that already exists. Why mock that through candy-colored tile? Our historic library – like the fabulous community that surrounds it – is a living mural already. It would be the saddest thing in the world to deface that, to turn a building that the whole country should be proud of into a reactionary art project. It’s like handing out crayons so that people can draw on the Mona Lisa. Or dressing up the Lincoln Memorial in cutoff jeans and flip flops. Not a good idea! Not respectful.

Tile!? I’m sure at some point, when everyone was tired, creating a mural in tile seemed like a good idea. But I almost need to put my head between my knees and breathe into a paper bag when I think about this. Once again, I urge you to look at this clinically: candy-colored tile glued onto a WWII era building. It’s such an implausible string of words that I can’t help but type them again, this time in italics: *candy-colored tile glued onto a WWII era building*. Why would we do anything to the building that wasn’t appropriate to its 1940 origins? When the library got its big renovation, we didn’t put orange shag carpet and ‘80s light fixtures in there. It didn’t get paisley wallpaper or aluminum and glass tables. The interior renovation was period-appropriate – which was a wonderful, respectful decision for a building of such architectural significance. Tile is an awfully permanent thing. It bears no relationship to the building whatsoever. The building is H-I-S-T-O-R-I-C. It is not an art project. Using tile is a defacement. Please tell me that someone in charge can see that!

NOTE	COMMENTS ABOVE PLUM COLORED LINE ARE NEW AND WERE SUBMITTED BOTH TO BLAP AND TO THE LIBRARY COMMENT BOX
LIBRARY BOX	<p>Comment #36: to similar to so many other murals. Something more original would be good.</p> <p>Comment # 37 Bravo – a very politically difficult challenge handled very skillfully. –<i>Michael Gillette</i>.</p>
Amy Trachtenberg	<p>Much appreciation always to those who stuck with the process of trying to find new solutions for the library artwork. They were however completely hamstrung by a lack of professional support in running the public art search and public art process. We can see that the structure for doing so did not allow for a breadth of viable proposals. Experienced artists did not want to navigate something as vague as the proposal offered without a budget. The community volunteers were never given the necessary support to do it right. The historic building and our revitalized neighborhood deserves much more.</p> <p>The proposed artwork is a reductive rehash of the old mural. During the mediation process, it was often voiced that a good process would engage with several qualified, experienced artists who would look both at the physical site of the building and available grounds and not necessarily be bound to applying tile or anything specifically to the building. Freestanding or 3-D pieces could have been imagined as could many other esthetic concepts on or near the building. A viable process would have the pool of qualified artists "read" the neighborhood histories and controversy including all of the contested histories, they'd do new interviews and their own research and then be very inventive and imaginative. The new artist(s) would take some leaps forward into the 21st century to devise projects that would engage the community and the site in ways that speak to the vibrancy of Bernal.</p> <p>To end up with no choices but a tiled reconfiguration of the old iconography: images that are entrenched and in many cases totally disconnected to anything Bernal, i.e. the Hokusai wave and the pyramids is worse than unfortunate. While reading like a logo, there is little in the new design that is reflective of moving forward or forward thinking. New avenues with new ideas weren't explored because there was not a structure or clear budget to do so. This assistance was promised to us by The Arts Commission on several occasions and especially if we conducted the serious mediation that we weathered with great success. That former SFAC director Luis Cancel struck deals or made promises behind closed doors to Bernal entities has resulted in an entrenched halfway solution that would leave very few folks feeling that our best efforts and polite conduct were artistically fruitful. The result does not live up to the profile of the award winning renovated library or the loving community support that it enjoys despite the controversy.</p> <p>These comments are based on my attendance and participation in most of the open meetings at both library and arts commissions as well as in early invited meetings with the arts and library commission and my full participation in the Mediation process. I did not join the Task Force because it appeared that the structure for a public art process was clearly lacking and unsupported by the powers that be, who should still be held responsible for the achievement of a higher quality of artwork in relation to the Bernal Library.</p> <p>I feel the 'civic leadership' absolved themselves of their responsibility to guide the process as it was not politically expedient to be involved. I feel even more strongly that Bernal citizens of great integrity were used and in many cases spent by this avoidable and arduous process. In doing so, we have not arrived at a palatable solution for a building which deserves enormous celebration inside and outside.</p>

<p>Jane Wattenberg</p>	<p>Dear BERNAL LIBRARY PROJECT and others still energetic, still with zeal, those who continue to hope for, lean towards, wish for, expect great results from The Bernal Library Commission and the Arts Commission, those aching for excitement, leadership, newness, cutting edge ART for the exterior of the Bernal Library, for Bernal as it is today-</p> <p>AMY TRACHTENBERG's letter speaks for me, for many on Bernal Hill. Please read it several times over and please listen to the thoughts brilliantly expressed within.</p>
<p>Deena Zacharin</p>	<p>I think you've probably received my letter that i left in the box at the library when i had difficulty posting on the blog. I agree with Amy Trachtenberg's letter whole heartedly. This process and the outcome does not seem to comply with the original consensus. Having been one of the people who worked hard to get a community conversation going around this, i find this critical part of the process (the artwork itself), to be less than a positive community experience. I hope we slow down and look at some other options.Thank you Amy for putting into words what many of us felt but could not as eloquently express!</p>
<p>Matt Sarconi</p>	<p>I live a block from the Bernal library, and would be interested in helping create the new tile facade(s), if needed or wanted.</p>
<p>Beth Pewther</p>	<p>I want to put in my opinion on the proposed designs.</p> <p>FRONT DESIGN: ...IS CLASSY and will not become outdated. I vote a Yea on that that one and would like to see it done in ceramic tile rather than paint which will fade.</p> <p>SIDE - MOULTRIE STREET: This design looks very dated and although I understand that it has been designed with an eye to honoring the muralists that worked on the old mural many years ago.... the original design wasn't artistically that well done to begin with. Some of the human figures represented in that old design which were NOT well drawn have been copied into the new design. While I appreciate the sentiment of that approach, I would rather see something NEW...THAT IS REALLY WELL DESIGNED and BEAUTIFUL.</p> <p>Tile is great and if done properly will last for many years without further maintenance. The "Tree of Life" theme which I interpret the tree to represent is fine...but I would prefer it be more stylized and colorful, and just plain Beautiful. Perhaps stylized forms of some of the animals; coyotes, Ravens, hawks and plants native to our hill could be used as elements.</p> <p>I am including some images of other tile projects that have been done around the city as reference. Some include names of doners on handmade tiles.</p> <p>Thanks Liz Breger</p> <p>Leonard & Liz Breger (a.k.a.Beth Pewther) artcrazy@artfools.com www.artfools.com</p>
<p>Richard Bee</p>	<p>I have not really been in favor of the mural especially if it was to be a re-imagining of the old mural. I like these designs. A bit of color in the front and just shades of brown with the tree on the side.</p>
<p>Mason Kirby</p>	<p>Good work all-- I am encouraged by both designs and how they work with the architectural scale and articulation of the existing building. I think the narrative quality of the proposed Cortland Street facade/mural is weak in comparison to the existing Cortland Street mural (occupying</p>

	<p>the same area as that portion of the proposed mural).</p> <p>I feel like the proposed Cortland mural presents a derivative copy of a portion of the least interesting part of the existing mural (intersecting waves from the pacific and central valley making spine of a a book. etc). Yours has been a hard fought stage to claim-- use it to share a story with the community--a real story of celebration/struggle/opportunity--and not a watered down derivation (ie <u>logo</u>) of what is already there.</p> <p>As a technical note: a better case may be made for both murals, if the drawings you are using show the background color of the existing building in context.</p> <p>Thanks for your hard work--</p>
<p>Vicky Walker</p>	<p>The front:</p> <p>Wow, Bernal library gets a mustache. And what a tacky New Age design that is. It signifies absolutely nothing. We've gone from 1980s-quality artwork to 1970s-quality artwork. This looks like it belongs on a canvas shopping bag or a student's Pee-Chee folder rather than on the wall of a magnificent WPA-era public structure.</p> <p>It has no connection the surrounding architecture, with the neighborhood, or with the theme of a library itself. It's a generic piece of colorful clip art. What does it represent? The tapestry of life? Rubbish.</p> <p>The back:</p> <p>For crying out loud, can we get rid of the extremely-not-S.F.-appropriate Native American? The Ohlone didn't have feathers in their hair like this cliched representation, although I like that the guy now has a six-pack.</p> <p>Does the fact that we can see Planet Earth in the background mean that we are all living on the Moon, or perhaps Planet Bernal? That might explain why there are no women in this mural, although maybe the generic "singing creature of indeterminate race who was on the front last time" is supposed to stand for my entire gender. Or the sour-faced Ohlone person next to Mr. Six-Pack.</p> <p>Are those supposed to be foggy clouds or legless sheep? Or perhaps it's ectoplasm? A tidal wave? Is the generic person summoning it? Far too stylized to tell.</p> <p>I fail to see how the Aztec pyramids to the left adequately represent the extremely diverse neighborhood of Bernal Heights, which, true, was first settled by the Ohlone and the Spanish, but then by the Irish, Italian, Swedish, German, English, and many other people during the 19th and 20th centuries. Sorry, muralists: You have to include white people somewhere. It's deeply reductive to label Bernal otherwise, regardless of your feelings about gentrification and change.</p> <p>I actually like the tree element of the mural. I'm deeply sad that Colette Crutcher is no longer part of the process. I think her work was the best of the bunch.</p>
<p>Wendy Miller</p>	<p>well they are better than what is there now, but they are still dated and inappropriate to the building. I question the wisdom of taking the only architecturally significant and public building on Cortland, and dumbing it down instead of celebrating it's architecture. The murals are (and look like) a compromise between the no-mural camp (me) and the no-</p>

	<p>change camp.</p> <p>Who will maintain these murals? who is going to insure that they don't look shabby, faded and ugly in 2 years? Who will touch them up as the inevitable graffiti accumulates?</p>
Paul Meuser	<p>I must compliment everyone who worked on this. Originally I felt very strongly that the old mural should be painted over and not be replaced. I was very disappointed when I learned that a new mural would be designed, but decided to wait and see what the proposed design looked like. I was amazed when I saw them while walking on Cortland Avenue recently. The design is very creative, has great use of color and theme, and kept some of the original components in a more compact composition - I love it!</p> <p>Great work,</p>
Eugenie Marek	<p>I would like the library exterior to be returned to its original condition - no murals.</p>
bee zim	<p>These comments are sent in the spirit of open conversation with my neighbors. What happened to the idea of a mural on the side or back and a plain front to set off the architecture? We don't see examples of classic architecture like this anymore. Couldn't we leave the original intent on one side, that is a simple front? Everyday we are bombarded by photos and signs; couldn't we just give our eyes a rest and have blank space? To me this is less a question of the history of the neighborhood and I've lived here for more than 30 years so I understand those concerns. (I couldn't afford to buy a home here now.) The fact that people were allowed to paint on a classic building in the early '80s shouldn't mean we have to perpetuate it. Murals don't work on some buildings. There needs to be perspective, the ability to view a large scale art work from a certain distance. It's not possible on the front. Also these murals remind me of many that we've all seen a lot. Please reconsider! Thanks for taking the time to read my comments.</p>
Ellen Egbert	<p>At the Library Commission meeting I voiced my concern re prepping the entire building for repainting as well as for your project and, in response to a "prepping" question from one of the commissioners, I believe Gia responded that you folks would be responsible for necessary prep. Are you really assuming responsibility for prepping the entire building or just the portions on which you will be applying tile? It seems to me that it would make sense for the entire building to be prepped and painted prior to the installation of the tile art to make sure the finished project is not "dripped on" or otherwise damaged as might be the case if the painting of the building occurred afterward.</p> <p>In your written description of the tile work to be added to the Cortland facade, you indicated that it would be "form fitted painted ceramic tile, glazed, fired, set and grouted to finish". Is this the same on the Moultrie side? If not, how will it differ? The posted design looks to me as if the Moultrie Street side uses tiles that are mostly, if not entirely, the same square shape and size. Judging by the relationship shown in the pictures to the actual size of the window panes, I'd judge about 8"X8". Is this right and will this be the size of all tiles on the Moultrie wall? Also, I wonder whether your intent is have the tiles adhere directly to the building or whether they will be mounted to some sort of backing that might enable the work could be more readily saved if, at some future time, removal were deemed appropriate?</p> <p>I am pleased to see that the colors depicted for the Cortland side are reflective of the soft shades in the mural as it is now rather than harsher and brighter colors as they existed prior to fading. I hope you can include a little more green in the design to harmonize and blend with the green chosen by the architect for the window frames and lamp post. I also wonder</p>

	<p>if the design couldn't be slightly altered to allow a little more space between the identifying "Bernal Heights Branch" lettering to insure that it won't be overpowered by the colored tiles close to it.</p> <p>It was my understanding that a <u>few</u> of the images from the "old" mural were to be included in the new design and was, therefore, surprised to see so many incorporated as foliage. Did the community deem all of these important or could some be replaced with images that might better reflect Bernal?</p> <p>I don't pretend to be qualified as an art critic and I read that the background grid on the Moultrie side is included as a part of bringing "a cohesive look and feel" to the design. Perhaps it is because the I am viewing such a small image but, to me, the tiles evoke the look and feel of a bathroom and the predominant brown and yellow colors used in the piece do nothing to contradict that impression.</p> <p>At the Library Commission meeting, Larry Cruz stated that the artwork designs shown were NOT a final product. And Supervisor Campos' aide Sheila told us that the meeting was just the beginning of an opportunity for the community members to weigh in. Thank you on the task force and the artists for hearing us. I hope that you are scheduling some opportunities for community dialog prior to additional presentations to the either the library or art commissions. Sending comments to the gmail address seems like a very one-sided conversation.</p>
<p>Janet Bidwell-Brambila</p>	<p>It is quite a compromise. I do like the new design.</p> <p>If this is the final product, I am optimistic and hope that everyone will enjoy it.</p>
<p>Rosanne Liggett</p>	<p>Greetings: I have a number of questions I'd like a reply to: 1. Who will answer questions addressed at this email? I sent a comment once before awhile ago and there was never an acknowledgement much less a response. 2. How will comments collected about the library art project be collected and relayed to the public? When the project committee held its public meeting and solicited comment about the old mural and what people wanted to see in the future, there was never any public report about the results. These two things should be addressed so that the committee maintains communication and "sunshine" to the larger community. Along these lines, it is unfortunate that the proposed new artwork was not presented to the community for comment and adjustments before going to the library commission. The proposed artwork is should be considered "preliminary", subject to improvement. My comment about the new artwork proposed for the front of the library is that it looks ridiculous! Like a large mustache in a childrens' book. It is not appropriate artwork and the library deserves a lot better.</p>
<p>Heather Fife</p>	<p>Where are the women? Where are the children? Where are the white people? Where is there reference to LGBT? Where are the dogs?</p>
<p>Michelle Smith</p>	<p>I know it's likely premature, but will community volunteers be able to be involved in painting the mural? My daughter has been asking if we'll be able to help!</p>
<p>John Blackburn</p>	<p>I have already put some comments in the library box but I'll post some additional ones to you as well. You asked so I'll give you my feedback. But, you better fasten your seat belt - it's going to be a bumpy ride...</p>

I have lived on the hill since 1980 and have watched the process unfold - a process that has pitted and divided this hill over race, tone and tenor and aesthetics for years, and no end in sight. The current controversy, with the WPA-era library mural project, is just another nail in the coffin of, "can't we all just get along."

I make no bones about my dislike for what those at the neighborhood center have done to "improve" the community while cashing in along the trail of tears and fears for their own financial and political gain. Many have been used and abused as the power brokers have staked their claims and moved on or died. Their legacy is not a pretty sight. And in many ways it is Bernal's to own.

I attended one community meeting and was, quite frankly, appalled at the "us vs. them" mentality that permeated the room - so thick you couldn't cut it with a Ginsu knife. Wrong way to gather consensus on a project affecting everyone. But then some don't get it, and never will. Agendas have a funny way of creeping into community process. The threatening tone was uncalled for and never productive.

The best solution for the library is to leave it pristine - as are the other city library buildings. No murals, period. Just like they were constructed by the WPA. Why is our library any different? We are not so special that we should have a painted lady on Cortland. We have an absolutely beautiful masterpiece of WPA construction that should be a memorial in and for the community at large and act as a piece of living history for the up and coming generations - unadulterated and simply beautiful in its architecture, design, style and grace. It is a class act - and reflects what Bernal Heights is to those that live here. It truly represents, in its own way, what Bernal Heights is many of us that call the hill home. It is a symbol for us all, not a symbol for just a few.

If there have to be murals on the library, the tile design on the Cortland facade, if done exactly as planned, without any hidden symbolism, is actually quite beautiful, and unifying in its design and use of color. Quite elegant. But my preference would be no murals.

The mural on the Moultrie facade is not appropriate. Far too stylized and symbolic and not representative of the history of the hill and all of its many and varied occupants over time. It is exclusive, not inclusive in its design and message. And that message must live on for future generations.

The problem lies in that no one group owns the hill or the right to claim it as their own - that is the crux of the battle that has been waged for years on the hill, and the current battle being fought over the library mural issue. Those that forget history are doomed to forget it - and many have their reasons to do so. Sometimes it is convenient for some to forget the others in their quest to not be forgotten.

We have to go back to the Ohlone Indians and all of the succeeding ethnic and social groups that have controlled, lived on and contributed to the hill since the early days before and after California was established as a state. The list of inhabitants is too long and any mural trying to represent everyone would stretch around the entire

library and probably down the Andover wall as well - not a pretty sight.

I simply don't, and will never support the ethnocentric belief that any one group holds sway over the hill. It isn't just the Spanish or the Mexican landowners. It is so many peoples, so many cultures, so many contributions. No, I am not saying we should forget the Bernal family - they are an important and essential element to the historical context and history of Bernal Heights. To shut out stylized, symbolic ethnicity is not to shut out the Bernals or the other indigenous peoples who have lived, worked and died on the hill so we can be here enjoying life on the hill today. If the mural is to truly represent the hill and its varied residents, it cannot be ethnocentric in design and symbolism.

We need to strike a balance - the best balance is no murals, in my view. No murals puts the entire issue to rest. But if we must be "inclusive," then we must include all of the diversity that has made the hill the outstanding place to live that it has become. Start listing all of the cultural and ethnic groups that have lived on and contributed to the hill - the mural would go on and on and on and on. I don't know if there is enough space in town...

Look at the tree - even the Indian isn't an Ohlone Indian! They were here first and who stole it from them...and the beat goes on.

My pithy rant is over. My thoughts are out. Thanks for all of your tireless efforts working on this rather daunting project. I don't envy the decision makers who must make and live with the final decision. No one is truly going to be happy, no matter which way it goes - that may be just a part of the divisive nature of our current political climate of fear and alienation. We will, in the end, have to live with the consequences of whatever decision is made.

I for one believe simplicity in design and execution is preferable to stylized symbolism.

Sue A. Blackman

From: Rosanne Liggett [rosanneadana@hotmail.com]
Sent: Friday, July 15, 2011 4:55 AM
To: Sue A. Blackman
Subject: Bernal library art project

Greetings:

The ideas for the Bernal library artwork were decided upon by just a few people in our community. These art ideas have been presented as "final" without any public discussion. There have been no public meetings to present the artwork. The committee has done minimal outreach. Some posters are up in several locations with an invitation to comment in small print via email and a box in the library. We are not sure how the comments that are gathered will be summarized and publicized. Emails to the bernallibraryartproject with inquiries are not responded to.

There should be choices for the art design, and perhaps a more vigorous and less biased search for artists. Precita Eyes has been shaping and influencing the debate about the library art for years. It was a glaring conflict of interest for the director of Precita Eyes, Susan Cervantes, to serve on the consensus committee. The consensus committee was flawed from the start with that and with the fact that it consisted of four folks related to the Neighborhood Center - which was an early advocate for keeping the old mural and getting it re-painted (by Precita Eyes).

The first thing that needs to happen was brought up by Ellen Egbert at the last library commission meeting: the need to have the exterior of the library building completely prepared before any new art work is applied. The exterior walls are badly deteriorated from years of neglect. It needs to be re-surfaced with cracks repaired, years of dirt removed. This will take time - and money.

There needs to be a re-examination of the mind-set that there has to be art on three sides of the library building. That is how the library mural art is now but it does not have to be on all three sides in the future. It is wasteful of resources and is not necessary. What other branch library has even two sides, or yet one side with art on it? Also the design ideas as they stand at this time are done by two different artists and are not harmonious.

In summation, this project is ill-conceived and not ready to go forward. It is better to take more time to do it right and have a result that does the excellent interior renovation justice. We would like to be proud of new artwork (and not just have to say, well, it is better than the old mural.)

Sincerely, Rosanne Liggett

Former CNL representative; Bernal library advocate and user

